

Programme of a Competition
for the Selection of an Architect
for a Church Edifice

Proposed to be built by the
Protestant Episcopal Mission
of St. Paul, at Overbrook,
Philadelphia, and to be known
as

**"The Memorial Church of St. Paul,
Overbrook"**

Programme of Competition

PART I

General Statement

a. The Mission has received the proffer of a gift from Mrs. William Simpson, Jr., Mr. W. P. Simpson and Mr. David Morgan of the sum of Twenty Thousand Dollars, to be employed under certain conditions in the erection of a church edifice.

b. These conditions, in so far as they pertain to the building of the church, are as follows, viz.:

That the said sum is "to be expended in the erection and construction of a stone church with a seating capacity of (in the neighborhood of) three hundred and fifty persons;" that "the said sum of twenty thousand dollars is to be expended solely for the erection of the church building proper, and for such expenses as shall be necessarily incident thereto, including the installation of pews and the necessary apparatus for lighting and heating. All interior furnishings and fittings, including decorations, organ, pulpit, desks, chancel rail, stalls, altar, et cetera, are to be provided and paid for by the Mission out of moneys to be secured from other sources, nor is any debt to be incurred or imposed upon the parish in the provision of such decorations, furnishings and fittings."

That "to whatever name shall hereafter be selected for said church and parish shall be added the word 'Memorial'" (the name "St. Paul, Overbrook" was subsequently adopted for the church).

That the donors "shall have the privilege of erecting in the church porch a suitable mural tablet reciting that the church has been erected to the memory of William Simpson, Jr.," and finally,

That "the rector hereafter to be installed shall be a churchman of recognized moderate views, and the services to be conducted in said church shall be in strict accordance with the Canonical Law of the Protestant Episcopal Church, and free from ritualistic form or ceremony."

c. The Advisory Committee of the Mission has accepted this proffer, and has appointed a Building Committee to execute its purpose.

d. The Building Committee consists of seven persons, viz., Professor Warren P. Laird (chairman), Dr. Edward Brooks, Messrs. Edwin E. Cassell, John E. Payne, W. Percy Simpson, Lewis A. Thompson and Edward G. McCollin (secretary).

e. The duties and powers of the Building Committee, as defined by the resolution appointing it, are as follows :

It is "directed and empowered to proceed with the purchase of land for and the erection of a church edifice ;" "said committee in the performance of its duties to conform to the conditions governing the acceptance by the Mission of the gift proffered by Mrs. William Simpson, Jr., and others ; said committee to select an architect, secure plans, execute contracts for the proposed building, and perform all duties properly pertaining to its office as a building committee ; provided, however, that it shall not adopt the general plan for the building until the same shall have been approved by the Advisory Committee or the Vestry."

f. The Building Committee has secured as a site for the proposed church a plot of ground lying on Lancaster Avenue, between Overbrook Avenue and Sherwood Road, a plan of which accompanies this programme, constituting Appendix A thereof.

PART II

The Competition

a. The Building Committee has established this limited competition for the purpose of selecting an architect for the proposed building.

b. It has appointed Prof. Warren P. Laird, of the University of Pennsylvania, and a member of the Committee, to

act as its Professional Adviser in the preparation of this programme and in the making of an award.

c. The prize of this competition will be the commission to design and supervise the erection of the proposed building under the terms set forth in Part VI.

d. The prize will be awarded to that competitor whose design shall be designated the "Premiated Design," as hereinafter provided.

e. The following-named architects have accepted the invitation of the Committee to submit designs in this competition, which will be restricted to them, viz. :

BAILY AND TRUSCOTT
COPE AND STEWARDSON
FIELD & MEDARY
FREDERICK M. MANN
W. L. AND W. F. PRICE

DAVID K. BOYD
FRANK MILES DAY & BRO.
WESTRAY LADD
GEORGE NATTRESS & SON
RANKIN & KELLOGG
EDGAR V. SEELER

f. It being manifestly impossible to secure in competition a design carefully studied out and perfected in all its details and capable of execution at an exact point of cost, the Committee announces that it desires and expects to secure in each competitive design a carefully studied general scheme only, whose completed character shall be intelligibly and sufficiently indicated in the competitive drawings, and whose cost in execution as regards the portion described in "h," Part III, shall not exceed the amount specified, as hereinafter determined (see "h," Part III and "f," Part V.)

PART III

The Building

a. The building to be erected by this Committee is that provided for as stated in "b," Part I.

b. To this building the Committee will add, as it may secure funds therefor, such chancel furnishings and fittings and organ, stalls, etc., as may be necessary to prepare it for its services. The building so erected and equipped is known in this programme as the "Present Building."

c. It is the belief that the Parish to be formed from this Mission will ultimately require a seating capacity in its church building of five hundred.

d. As this can be realized only by additions to the Present Building, and as such additions must have the effect, architecturally, either of injuring a design complete in itself or perfecting a design incomplete without them, the Committee have decided to plan at present for a building adapted to the future requirements of the Parish. This building is known in this programme as the "Final Building."

e. The Committee therefore suggests to competitors as an important consideration that the Final Building be so designed that the Present Building shall, when erected, be as nearly complete and perfect in itself as may be possible, in order that the apparent need of additions to render it complete may be reduced to a minimum. The Committee will be influenced in its selection by the degree of completeness, in any given design displayed by its Present Building alone, and by the simplicity and economy of its possible expansion into the Final Building.

f. Requirements of the Final Building:

Competitors will be expected to conform to conditions made binding upon this Committee as set forth in Part I.

It is desired that the church be built in one of the purer phases of the Gothic style, preferably of the English Gothic; but, beyond the requirement that the design shall be, historically speaking, reasonably consistent, no limitations are imposed upon the designer as to choice of inspiration or of motive.

Designs may present a scheme either with or without clerestory, but must provide for the hanging of a bell, either by means of tower or belfry.

Full provision must be made for the offices of a service such as is specified in "b," Part I.

Five hundred sittings are to be provided for the congregation, each with unobstructed view of the chancel. Each is to have a clear width of nineteen inches, exclusive of pew ends and partitions—twenty inches being preferred by the committee. Pews are to be set not less than two feet eight inches on centres; two feet ten inches being preferred. Aisles are to be in width not less than five feet for main and three feet six inches for minor aisles.

Choir stalls are to be twenty-four in number, and of size and spacing same as specified for pews.

The memorial tablet and a baptismal font are to have locations indicated on the plans.

Vestry, organ loft and choir room are to be provided, the latter in basement if desired; direct access from outside being provided for latter and for vestry.

Exit from communion-rail other than by main aisle of approach is desired.

A porte-cochere entrance to church is to be provided.

A finished basement story is to be provided, with clear height of not less than ten feet, for Sunday-school rooms, and is to have, in all, four exits—two directly to outside; at least half the height of window-pierced walls of basement to be above ground; basement to have direct inside communication with entrances to main body of church, and to be light, dry and well-aired. The basement is to have no partition, but all walls and ceiling are to be plastered, floor cemented and windows finished.

The church edifice must be built, externally, entirely of stone. Internally it may be planned for finish of stone or plaster, either or both, for wall surfaces, but any piers, columns, arches, corbels, etc., must be in stone.

g. Requirements of the Present Building :

The seating capacity of this part of the Final Building must not be less than three hundred and twenty-five persons. While a greater capacity than this is desirable, it will be held as of secondary importance to the proper adjustment of proportions between the Present and the Final Buildings.

The Present Building must provide everything required of the Final Building except sittings additional to three hundred and twenty-five.

h. Cost : The Committee desires to ensure a fair comparison of the designs in respect to the element of cost. It recognizes, however, that an estimate of cost upon a competitive plan can at best be no more than approximately accurate, and that, based upon different designs, such estimates being made by different builders, must be prepared from differing points of view and under varying conceptions of a proper finished character for the building, thus rendering comparison impossible.

The Committee will therefore inform itself with respect to this question by securing from a competent builder estimates upon such designs, not fewer than three, which seem to most especially merit consideration for the award of the prize. In making this selection it will take account of the general recommendations of its Adviser, and no design will be awarded the prize upon whose cost an estimate has not been secured.

Such estimate will cover only that portion of the Present Building described in "*b*," Part I, and "*a*" and "*h*," Part III, and will be based on both drawings and description.

The evidence presented by this estimate will count as an important factor in the award of the prize, any excess in cost counting, proportionately to such excess, against such award. The Committee must in fairness refuse the selection of any design of excessive cost, however slight such excess, in case such design be incapable of reduction in cost without loss of the peculiar merit which may entitle it to first place,

The cost of the structure referred to in "*b*," Part I, and "*a*," Part III, is not to exceed twenty thousand dollars. This sum is to pay for the completed structure, its heating under the system of central service now obtaining in Overbrook, ventilating and plumbing systems, excavation and grading, the installation of its pews and the payment of the architect's fees upon this part of the work of the Present Building. It is to include the filling of windows with a good quality of leaded glass. The materials of construction and finish, and the workmanship employed are to be of the best, but the ornamentation of the building is expected by the Committee to be simple rather than elaborate. All interior carving may be estimated to be left in the planed block form.

The cost of the remaining parts of the Present Building (chancel furniture, organ, etc., as named in "*b*," Part III,) and the expense of completing the Final Building do not form part of the problem presented in this programme, save that all such parts and additions shall in be proper consistency with that part whose cost is specified as regards their design and costliness.

i. Location. The Final Building is to be planned for that portion of the plot adjacent to Overbrook Avenue. The Committee prefer that the longitudinal axis of the plan shall be parallel to this street.

The building must not be placed nearer the Lancaster Avenue property line than twenty-five feet and must be placed twenty-five feet from the Overbrook Avenue property line. This restriction refers not to buttresses, steps, porches, etc., but to the wall lines of main structure or tower.

j. The remaining buildings, required to be indicated in the drawings, and comprising Parish House, Rectory and Carriage-sheds, are to be disposed upon the plot at the option of the designer, with the restriction that they shall not be placed nearer the street property lines than twenty-five feet.

Plans of Parish House and of Rectory need not be shown save in outline, but it is required that the superficial area of the ground floor of the former shall be between twenty-two hundred and twenty-five hundred square feet, and of the latter between twelve hundred and fifteen hundred square feet. The Carriage-sheds are to receive, conveniently, ten carriages.

PART IV The Drawings, etc.

1. The following drawings are required, to wit:

a. A general plan of the plot and its buildings. This plan is to show property lines on further side of all surrounding streets; all curb lines, pavements, walks, drives, Carriage-sheds, etc., and location of present large trees. Buildings are to be shown in block plan, giving their outer line only.

b. An elevation of the Lancaster Avenue frontage of plan "*a*."

c. A plan of the main floor of the Final Building, indicating by dotted lines the portion to be erected as the Present Building.

d. An elevation of the Lancaster Avenue front of the Final Building.

e. An elevation of the Overbrook Avenue side of the Final Building.

f. A transverse section of the Final Building, presenting an elevation of the chancel.

g. A perspective view of the plot and its buildings.

2. The scale, rendering and presentation of the drawings shall be as follows:

a. Scale, etc.: Drawings *a* and *b*, thirty-two feet to the inch; *c*, *d*, *e* and *f*, sixteen feet to the inch; *g* may be taken

from any point of view and drawn at any scale, but must not exceed in its extreme dimensions ten by fourteen inches.

b. Rendering: All drawings except *g* are to be wash drawings rendered in black and white; and no other color is to be applied to them.

Upon all elevations shadows are to be accurately rendered, cast at an angle with both horizontal and vertical planes of forty-five degrees. No shadows are to be cast upon any plan, nor upon the section, save that the shadows of large trees may be cast on "*a*."

All drawings are to be rendered without accessories of any kind, whether architectural or of scenery (this restriction applying to present trees, except as specified for "*a*"), save that a single human figure, five feet eight inches high, shall be drawn against each elevation and the section to indicate the scale, and except that in all drawings save "*g*," flat or graded washes may be employed to indicate ground or background and vestibules, corridors, stairs, etc. Any treatment of floor surfaces or ceiling construction may be indicated on floor plans. It is required that in all drawings save "*g*," the Parish House and Rectory be so designed and rendered as to merely suggest or indicate their general character as elements of the group.

c. The perspective is to be drawn in black ink, in pure line, on white paper, without wash or brush effects of any kind. No shadows are to be cast or rendered in the drawing, but voids in buildings may be darkened. No accessories of any kind, whether of architecture or of natural scenery, are to appear in the drawing, which is to show only the buildings of the group, the curb, pavement and grade lines, and a single human figure, of size specified for elevations, at or near a principal entrance to the church.

In preparing this drawing any structural (including jointing) line may be shown, but no indication may be made of color, tone or texture of surfaces.

All words and figures upon drawings shall be executed in simple lettering and not in script or handwriting.

No competitor shall be eligible to submit more than one design, but any drawing may contain flaps showing such alternative arrangements as do not change the design in its essential character.

d. Drawings are to be prepared on white paper in sheets cut to a uniform size of twelve by sixteen inches, and are to be neither mounted nor framed.

Each sheet is to bear the title "Competition for the Memorial Church of St. Paul, Overbrook," and only such other words as may be necessary to properly designate drawings or their parts, and the scale to which they may be drawn.

3. Description, outline specification, etc.

a. Each design is to be accompanied by a printed or typewritten statement, explaining any matters of especial importance pertaining to the design and not clearly set forth in the drawings.

This statement is especially to explain the manner in which the Present Building is to be finished at those points which will eventually receive the additions for the Future Building.

It is desired that this statement, rather than the plans, should show by means of a simple, figured block plan the principal dimensions of the church building; the width of aisles, number and dimensions of sittings and stalls, and other necessary information called for by this programme.

b. Each design is to be accompanied also by a simple specification in outline, describing the materials of structure and finish, and the workmanship proposed to be employed in the building.

4. Anonymity of Designs and Competitors.

No cypher or *nom de plume* or other designating device, shall appear upon any drawing or its accompanying description,

bid or envelope; nor shall any competitor reveal the identity of his design, or seek directly or indirectly to influence in his favor any member of the Building Committee, under penalty of exclusion from the competition and forfeiture of any claim for compensation.

PART V

Judgment and Award

a. Each design is to be accompanied by a sealed envelope addressed in typewriting to the Committee, containing the name and address of its author or authors.

b. The drawings of each design are to be placed in a portfolio or between stiff card boards and, together with the description, specification and the sealed envelope containing author's name and address, are to be enclosed in a sealed wrapper, addressed to the Secretary of the Committee, Edward G. McCollin, Esq., 514 Walnut Street, Philadelphia, and delivered to him not later than twelve o'clock noon of Saturday, October 1, 1898.

c. Each package so delivered will be opened by and under the supervision of the Committee, and its contents including the description, specification and sealed envelope given a number, by which they will be known in judging the designs.

d. The sealed envelopes will then be placed in the custody of the Secretary, and will not be opened until the award has been made.

e. The Professional Adviser will then examine the designs, and any whose drawings do not conform in number and character to the regulations of this programme, or which are accompanied by drawings, models or other means of illustration not called for by this programme, will, upon his recommendation, be placed out of competition. Designs thus

excluded from competition will, with statement of reasons for such exclusion, be returned to their authors, who shall forfeit any claim for compensation from this Committee.

f. The Professional Adviser shall then examine the remaining designs, and shall select that one which, in his opinion, gives promise of the best result when carefully studied and developed in all its parts and details, recommending it to the Committee for their choice as the "Premiated Design." In making this selection he will hold the design, with its accompanying description and specification, to define the professional and artistic capacity of its author for dealing with this especial problem.

The success with which this problem has been solved will therefore be measured in each case, both by the quality of the design as an essay in church architecture, and by the degree to which the various demands of the programme are realized; any essential gain or loss in matters of capacity, cost, convenience, etc., counting as merit or demerit, respectively, in this estimate. (See "*f*," Part II.)

g. The Professional Adviser will further select and designate in his report to the Committee those two other designs which seem to him to merit rank in second and third place respectively.

h. The Committee will then, after due consideration of the report of their Professional Adviser, and examination and consideration of the designs, select that one which, in their opinion, is the best, and will designate it as the Premiated Design.

i. The Committee will then open the envelope bearing the number of said Premiated Design, and will award to its author the prize of the competition by designating and appointing him the architect of the present building under the terms set forth in Part VI of this programme.

j. The Committee will then return forthwith to their authors the other competitive designs, and will make no use of

any of them or anything contained in them which is original as to this competition except by written permission of its author and on payment of proper compensation therefore as decided between him and the Committee.

k. None of the unaccepted drawings will be exhibited to the public nor to any other competitor without the written consent of its author.

l. The action of the Committee in the selection and appointment of an architect will be communicated to all competitors with the return of unaccepted drawings.

PART VI

The Architect

a. Compensation :

The architect appointed as above prescribed shall be paid as full compensation for his services, a commission of five per cent. of the cost of the work committed to his charge.

This work shall be that provided for by the gift described as "*b*," Part I, and such other work as the Building Committee may place in his charge.

b. Duties :

The appointed architect shall so revise his competitive drawings as to meet the further requirements of the Building Committee, and upon the basis of these revised preliminary drawings shall prepare fully detailed working drawings of the Present Building described in "*a*," Part III, and shall during its construction supervise the work, and shall have full and usual authority of architect of the work.

It is stipulated that the architect so appointed shall at his own cost make such revision and alteration of the working drawings and specifications of the work described in "*b*," Part I, and "*a*" and "*h*," Part III, as may be necessary to

ensure its proper construction and completion within the limit of the therein specified sum of Twenty Thousand Dollars.

All drawings, specifications and their copies, as instruments of service are and shall remain the property of the architect.

This programme approved by resolution of the Building Committee this Twenty-second day of August, A. D. 1898.

WARREN P. LAIRD,

Chairman.

EDWARD G. MCCOLLIN

Secretary.

NOTE. A preliminary draft of this programme was submitted to the Competitors, with a request for any suggestions which might in their opinion, promote the purpose of the competition. As approved, it represents the collaboration of the Committee, its Professional Adviser and the Competitors.